City of Lawrence
PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT SERVICES

LAWRENCE HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION
ACTION SUMMARY FOR **NOVEMBER 16, 2017**
CITY HALL, 6 E 6TH STREET
6:30 PM

Commissioners present: Bailey, Buchanan, Evans, Fry, Hernly, Veatch
Staff present: Dolar, Weik, Zollner

ITEM NO. 1: COMMUNICATIONS

A. No communications from other commissions, State Historic Preservation Officer, and the general public that were not in the packet.
B. No ex-parte communications.
C. No abstentions for specific agenda items by commissioners.
D. No Committee Reports

ITEM NO. 2: CONSENT AGENDA

A. Action Summary October 19, 2017
B. Administrative Approvals
   1. DR-17-00536 623 Vermont Street; Sign Permit; Certificate of Appropriateness and Downtown Design Guidelines Review.
   2. DR-17-00570 720 W 3rd Street; Commercial Remodel; Certificate of Appropriateness.
   3. DR-17-00571 816 Massachusetts Street; Sign Permit; State Law Review and Downtown Design Guidelines Review.
   4. DR-17-00579 603 Tennessee Street; Electrical Permit; State Law Review.
   5. DR-17-00581 816 Massachusetts Street; Electrical Permit; State Law Review.
   6. DR-17-00588 726 Massachusetts Street; Commercial Remodel; State Law Review.

ACTION TAKEN

Motioned by Commissioner Fry, seconded by Commissioner Veatch, to confirm the administrative approvals.

Unanimously approved 6-0.

ITEM NO. 3: PUBLIC COMMENT

Ms. KT Walsh said she did a mural about the Poehler family for their architecture and social history. In the future, she feels a Poehler group nomination would be appropriate.

ITEM NO. 4: L-17-00533 Public Hearing for consideration of placing the property located at 413 E. 7th Street, The Santa Fe Depot, on the Lawrence Register of Historic Places. Submitted by The City of Lawrence, property owner of record.

STAFF PRESENTATION
Ms. Zollner presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT
Ms. Lindsey Crick, Lawrence Preservation Alliance (LPA), said they're happy to have this on the register and lucky to have a group that's taken the time to rehab the building.

Ms. KT Walsh, East Lawrence Neighborhood Association (ELNA), seconded the comments made by LPA, adding that everyone has worked so hard on this nomination.

ACTION TAKEN
Motioned by Commissioner Buchanan, seconded by Commissioner Fry, to recommend the property at 413 E 7th Street, the Santa Fe Depot, for designation as a Landmark on the Lawrence Register of Historic Places.

Unanimously approved 6-0.

Motioned by Commissioner Buchanan, seconded by Commissioner Fry, to adopt the environs definition as provided.

Unanimously approved 6-0.

Motioned by Commissioner Bailey, seconded by Commissioner Veatch, to adopt Resolution 2017-11.

Unanimously approved 6-0.

ITEM NO. 5: L-17-00062 Public Hearing for consideration of placing the property located at 801 Alabama Street, the Louis C. & Eva Poehler House, on the Lawrence Register of Historic Places. Submitted by Lawrence Preservation Alliance on behalf of James A. Slater II and Geraldine Slater, property owners of record.

STAFF PRESENTATION
Ms. Zollner presented the item.

Commissioner Bailey asked what a gambrel roof subtype looks like.

Ms. Zollner showed a close up photo of the roof on the property.

Commissioner Bailey said the fenestration stands out.

APPLICANT PRESENTATION
Mr. Dennis Brown, LPA, asked the Commission to approve the nomination as well as the other three, noting that the architectural documentation is provided. He also noted that the code has not undergone any changes since all other landmarks have been submitted and approved.

NO PUBLIC COMMENT

COMMISSION DISCUSSION
Commissioner Bailey feels this property is applicable under Criteria #6.

Commissioner Hernly assumed this would be approved in October when he was absent. It's a unique house and a significant property, but he feels it would take a pretty major project to reach the threshold of denial from this board.

Commissioner Buchanan likes that they're seeing vernacular homes for nomination.

ACTION TAKEN
Motioned by Commissioner Buchanan, seconded by Commissioner Veatch, to recommend the property at 801 Alabama Street for designation as a Landmark on the Lawrence Register of Historic Places and adopt Resolution 2017-07.

Unanimously approved 6-0.

Motioned by Commissioner Buchanan, seconded by Commissioner Veatch, to adopt the environs definition as provided.

Unanimously approved 6-0.

Mo

ITEM NO. 6: L-17-00122 Public Hearing for consideration of placing the property located at 1645 Kentucky Street, the Thaddeus D. & Elizabeth K. Prentice House, on the Lawrence Register of Historic Places. Submitted by Lawrence Preservation Alliance on behalf of Robert Benton Peugh II, property owner of record.

STAFF PRESENTATION
Ms. Zollner presented the item.

NO APPLICANT PRESENTATION

NO PUBLIC COMMENT

COMMISSION DISCUSSION
Commissioner Hernly said he always takes notice of this home because it stands out from the rest.

Commissioner Veatch said he often admires the property as well.

Commissioner Bailey said it looks well built with a lot of attention to detail.

ACTION TAKEN
Motioned by Commissioner Veatch, seconded by Commissioner Fry, to recommend the property at 1645 Kentucky Street for designation as a Landmark on the Lawrence Register of Historic Places and adopt Resolution 2017-08.

Unanimously approved 6-0.

Motioned by Commissioner Veatch, seconded by Commissioner Fry, to adopt the environs definition as provided.

Unanimously approved 6-0.

ITEM NO. 7: L-17-00147 Public Hearing for consideration of placing the property located at 2127 Barker Avenue, the Adam and Annie Rottman House, on the Lawrence Register of Historic Places. Submitted by Lawrence Preservation Alliance on behalf of Brian and Ursula Kuhn-Laird, property owners of record.

STAFF PRESENTATION
Ms. Zollner presented the item.

Commissioner Bailey asked about one of the windows.

Ms. Zollner explained that it was filled in for a bathroom. She explained that the side of the home faces Barker Avenue.

Commissioner Hernly asked about the history of the porch.

Ms. Zollner said it is not original but it's historic.

Commissioner Veatch asked about eligibility for the State and National registers.

Ms. Zollner said it would not be eligible for the State or National register due to the existing addition. She discussed the land use pattern in the area and the resulting division of land.

NO APPLICANT PRESENTATION

NO PUBLIC COMMENT

COMMISSION DISCUSSION
Commissioner Bailey asked if they've approved an Italianate style home for the register.

Ms. Zollner said there are several, but this one is unique due to the L-shape plan and the location.

ACTION TAKEN
Motioned by Commissioner Bailey, seconded by Commissioner Buchanan, to recommend the property at 2127 Barker Avenue for designation as a Landmark on the Lawrence Register of Historic Places and to adopt Resolution 2017-10.

Unanimously approved 6-0.

Motioned by Commissioner Bailey, seconded by Commissioner Buchanan, to adopt the environs definition as provided.

Unanimously approved 6-0.

ITEM NO. 8: L-17-00123 Public Hearing for consideration of placing the property located at 1655 Mississippi Street, the Twenhofel-Eikenberry House, on the Lawrence Register of Historic Places. Submitted by Lawrence Preservation Alliance on behalf of Mabel Rice, property owner of record.

STAFF PRESENTATION
Ms. Zollner presented the item.

Commissioner Bailey asked about the side gable.

Commissioner Hernly explained that the side gable is a way of defining the direction of the roof relative to the main façade.

NO APPLICANT PRESENTATION

PUBLIC COMMENT
Mr. Scott Mitchell read the communication he previously submitted.

Mr. Matt Jones, 1323 New York Street, said they (Struct/Restruct) love historic structures and designing new interesting ideas, but the environs review process creates a much more tepid design result, and isn't friendly for neighbors.

Ms. KT Walsh, said she is shocked to hear from Struct/Restruct and their feelings toward environs review. She noted that plenty of nominations have been turned down, and a lot of hard work and money goes into a good nomination. She said the Architectural Review Committee is free professional advice and a good resource for applicants.

Ms. Ann Beedles said she lives north of the property and does not support the nomination due to the environs review.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION
Ms. Zollner clarified the purpose of the neighborhood meeting mentioned by Mr. Mitchell. She said several questions came up regarding environs but it was not a staff presentation about this project.

Commissioner Bailey asked if it was a neighborhood association meeting.

Ms. Zollner said yes.

Commissioner Buchanan said the public hearing allows participation by notified residents.

Commissioner Bailey said they only make recommendations to the City Commission. He said it seems that 100% of the opposition is due to environs review, but the Commission doesn't create the code, they follow it. City Commission is the venue for voicing concerns about code.

Commissioner Buchanan agreed with Ms. Walsh about the negative stigma surrounding the environs process, and believes it could use more education and clarification.

Commissioner Hernly feels this is a unique neighborhood - he asked if there has been a survey.

Ms. Zollner said there has been a survey, and this is one of the neighborhoods highlighted in the Multiple Property Documentation Form.

Commissioner Hernly said it's a very unique property and neighborhood. He reiterated that it would take a very significant project to be truly affected by environs review.

Commissioner Bailey mentioned line of sight being a factor and talked about the architectural style.

Ms. Zollner stressed that properties of all architectural and socioeconomic styles should be included on the register.

Commissioner Bailey said they certainly don't want to water down the register and need good examples, and he feels this property does stand out.

Commissioner Hernly said his more 1950's than craftsman style, but at some point 1950's will start coming in for listing. The common house is the architectural style that gets trampled all the time, but is just as important.

Commissioner Bailey wanted to clarify, based on a comment made by Mr. Mitchell, that conflict of interest rules are clear and not an issue with this Commission.

ACTION TAKEN
Motioned by Commissioner Hernly, seconded by Commissioner Veatch, to recommend the property at 1655 Mississippi Street for designation as a Landmark on the Lawrence Register of Historic Places and to adopt Resolution 2017-09.

Unanimously approved 6-0.

Motioned by Commissioner Hernly, seconded by Commissioner Veatch to adopt the environs definition as provided.

Unanimously approved 6-0.

ITEM NO. 9: DR-17-00401 505 Tennessee Street; Residential Remodel; State Law Review. The property is a contributing structure to the Pinckney I Historic District, National Register of Historic Places. (The Historic Resources Commission approved the Certificate of Appropriateness for this project on October 19, 2017.) Submitted by Struct/Restruct, LLC on behalf of Robert A. Beck and Amy M. Pettle, property owners of record.

STAFF PRESENTATION
Ms. Zollner presented the item.

Commissioner Fry asked what action can be taken if the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) finds that the project does not meet the standards.

Ms. Zollner explained that the State Law agreement between the City and the SHPO allows the Historic Resources Commission (HRC) to complete the State Law Reviews, but the HRC can still request technical assistance from SHPO, which they did on this project.

APPLICANT PRESENTATION
Mr. Matt Jones, Struct/Restruct, explained details of the proposed project including energy studies, technical specifications, and revisions that were made to the project since October.

Commissioner Bailey asked about the spray-in insulation.

Mr. Jones said higher insulating products adhere to the surfaces which could damage historic integrity as a listed property.

Commissioner Hernly said the spray-in insulation isn't necessarily something that wouldn't be approved.

Mr. Jones said they really like the thermal break with the existing system.

Commissioner Buchanan asked if there has been a full energy audit on the entire building.

Mr. Rob Beck, property owner, said they paid Cromwell to do an energy test, and areas were insulated, but the problem is keeping the heat out. He doesn't feel asphalt roofs are character defining and feels the proposed roof structure is the best option for their needs. He said he'd be willing to give up the foam insulation if that brings down the profile enough, but the air space is key to the roof system.

Commissioner Buchanan asked if a lighter color roof and more ventilation is a possible alternative.

Mr. Beck explained that you can't vent an occupied attic, and the hot air can't escape otherwise.

Commissioner Buchanan asked if it would be acceptable if the rigid foam wasn't possible but the metal shingles were still a possibility.

Mr. Beck said as long as the air space is provided that would be ok.

Commissioner Veatch feels the metal roof without the buildup would be compatible and maybe even approved administratively.

Commissioner Hernly asked if the metal shingles attach directly to the sheathing.

Mr. Jones said yes.

NO PUBLIC COMMENT

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Hernly said the Sustainability Guidelines were helpful but he has a trained eye, so three inches on top of a roof stands out. He acknowledged the benefit for the roof design, but isn't sure the insulation in the joist space is maximized in terms of what could be approved.

Commissioner Bailey said it stands out even with an untrained eye. He asked if the SHPO was present during the site visit to this property.

Ms. Zollner said yes. She said they spent a significant amount of time trying to determine whether only select portions of roof could be altered to minimize the impact.

Commissioner Veatch asked if staff feels reducing the build-up but keeping an air space might be agreeable.

Ms. Zollner said she would prefer to first rule out other options that won't change the roof form.

Commissioner Veatch said they could even apply Criteria 1 as it applies to historic use of the property, because the attic was not historically occupied.

Commissioner Bailey asked if the ARC can work on the roof design.

Ms. Zollner said staff could possibly review a metal roof only administratively or the ARC could get involved with more design options. She did not feel reducing the build-up of the roof system would change staff's recommendation of denial.

Commissioner Bailey noted SHPO's opinion on the project and the issue with making irreversible changes to the property.

Commissioner Buchanan explained that the system is too modern to know how the affect it might have on the structure over time.

Mr. Beck said the ventilated roof has been around for years. He explained his efforts in trying to make his home more efficient, and asked if they could work with the ARC on the roof.

Commissioner Hernly asked the applicant about the structure of the attic.

Mr. Beck explained the attic structure.

Commissioner Hernly said he wouldn't mind looking at the project with the ARC.

Ms. Zollner said they would need to specify a date to bring the project back to the Commission. She asked the Commission to be specific in its direction to the ARC.

Commissioner Hernly said he would be interested in seeing a way to get a ventilated air space that doesn't affect the profile of the roof edge in a substantial way. He asked about the minimum air space.

Mr. Beck offered to share technical articles that address optimal air space.

Commissioner Hernly asked if there's a possible mechanical ventilation component.

Mr. Beck said he's not aware of any.

Commissioner Hernly asked if it would be beneficial to ventilate the knee wall space.

Mr. Beck said his research indicates that insulating is more efficient than ventilating.

Commissioner Hernly said he's interested in optimizing the roof system with minimal impact on the historic character of the house. He felt some technical understanding would be beneficial.

Ms. Zollner said staff and the SHPO have worked with the National Alliance of Preservation Commissions and the National Park Service and the proposed roof system has yet to be approved for a house.

Commissioner Hernly was mostly concerned with finding the minimum amount of air space for optimal roof performance while maintaining the structure's historic character.

Commissioner Erby suggested the ARC should only determine what is visually appropriate. Commissioner Hernly didn't feel it was worthwhile to make alterations if they weren't technically feasible. He mentioned the ARC could also discuss roof edge detail that might lessen the impact of the profile.

Ms. Zollner cautioned the Commission in moving forward with a referral to the ARC without additional technical information and advice from an expert and without time for staff and the SHPO to evaluate it.

Commissioner Hernly said that was reasonable.

Commissioner Buchanan asked if the applicant can provide specs on the roofing system.

Mr. Beck said he could.

Ms. Zollner asked that the Commission give specific direction and make requests for materials for consideration by staff and the ARC. She did not feel it would be reasonable to bring the project back in December.

Commissioner Hernly and Commissioner Buchanan said they will need technical information that evaluates a cool roof, including the optimal and minimal amount of air space, as well as information regarding the use of a radiant barrier, knee wall ventilation, alternative sheathing systems, and roof material specifications. The Committee will then determine whether there is a way to install the roof system using the Secretary of Interiors Standards.

They discussed when the next possible ARC meeting could be held, and decided the project would be seen by the ARC on December 7th and come back to the HRC January 18th.

ITEM NO. 10: DR-17-00578 516 W 6th St; Demolition of Accessory Structure and New Construction of Accessory Structure; State Law Review and Certificate of Appropriateness. The property is located in the Pinckney I Historic District, National Register of Historic Places; the accessory structure is non-contributing to the historic district. The property is also located in the environs of the Dillard House (520 Louisiana Street), Lawrence Register of Historic Places. Submitted by

STAFF PRESENTATION
Ms. Katherine Weik presented the item.

Commissioner Veatch asked if just the accessory structure is non-contributing.

Ms. Weik said yes.

NO APPLICANT PRESENTATION

NO PUBLIC COMMENT

COMMISSION DISCUSSION
Commissioner Hernly said the wide garage door may not be appropriate, and suggested three doors might work better than the proposed.

Ms. Weik said it is a non-contributing structure with no line of sight, and the double door does exist within the district.

Commissioner Buchanan said she understands the functionality of the proposed design. She asked if they could add detail on the east elevation to break it up.

Ms. Weik explained why they cannot add anything more.

ACTION TAKEN
Motioned by Commissioner Bailey, seconded by Commissioner Veatch, to approve the proposed project and find that it does not damage or destroy any historic property included in the National Register of Historic Places or the State Register of Historic Places, and to direct staff to administratively approve any minor alterations to the project.

Unanimously approved 6-0.

Motioned by Commissioner Bailey, seconded by Commissioner Veatch, to issue the Certificate of Appropriateness and make the determination that the proposed project does not encroach upon, damage, or destroy the environs of the listed historic property.

Unanimously approved 6-0.

ITEM NO. 11: MISCELLANEOUS MATTERS

A. No Zoning Amendments, Special Use Permits, and Zoning Variances received since October 19, 2017.

B. No demolition permits received since October 19, 2017.

C. Miscellaneous matters from City staff and Commission members.

Ms. Zollner said there would be no meeting in December but KOMA training in January.

Commissioner Bailey asked if the Commission could begin meetings at 6:00 and also asked about the Chapter 22 update.

Ms. Zollner said they could discuss a meeting time change in January and explained the status of Chapter 22.

ADJOURN 9:12 PM